The Affordances and Disadvantages of WordReference Forums as a Space for Intercultural Exchange

Elizabeth Mayne
Department of French and Italian
University of Texas at Austin

International Research Days
Université Rennes 2, Rennes, France
October 24, 2015
Past SLA studies in telecollaborative learning:

-belz & kinginger (2002)
-belz (2003)
-blyth (2012)
Wenger (2000): Learning is “an interplay between social competence and personal experience”, and continues to qualify it as a “dynamic, two-way relationship between people and the social systems in which they participate” (226).

“Modes of belonging”:
- engagement
- imagination
- alignment

These modes usually coexist in a social learning system, but one “can dominate and thus give a different quality to the social structure” (228).
Nature of online discussion fora

- On WRF, there is not a direction for specific topics, but they are supposed to be related to language.
- On WRF, the posters direct the topics of posts, but there are moderators.
- On WRF, moderators can merge posts and delete irrelevant posts.
Founded in 1999 by Michael Kellogg

A word from the creator:

The Internet has done an incredible job of bringing the world together in the last few years. One of the greatest barriers has been language [...] I have three main goals with WordReference. First, continue to create free online bilingual dictionaries for English to many other languages. I strive to offer excellent translations for "all" English words, terms, idioms, sayings, etc. into "all" languages [...] Beyond English, I plan to do the same for Spanish, French, Italian and Portuguese. Second, provide the world's best language forums, dedicated to relatively serious discussion about the meanings and translations of words, terms and expressions in many languages. Third, continue to innovate to produce the best website and reference tools for the world. (my emphasis)

http://www.wordreference.com/english/AboutUs.aspx
What can we learn from WRF?

- What kinds of questions do non-natives ask?
- Who responds to the questions?
- *Tu* vs. *vous* is a pragmatic variable
  - What do the posts tell us about native and non-native pragmatic competence?
  - Is there an aspect of cultural exchange?
- Is this telecollaborative learning?
- Is there a pedagogical element that we can incorporate in the classroom?
Merged WordReference thread:

\texttt{tu/vous-tutoyer/vouvoyer-tutoiement/vouvoiement}

As well as some supporting references from other related threads
Demographic information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Native language</th>
<th>Number of posts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other languages included Spanish, Portuguese, Italian, Swedish
Bilinguals: French-English, Hindi-English, British English-Russian

Total number of posts: n=216
Total number of words from native French speakers’ posts: 10,433
Total number of words from non-native French speakers: 7,642
Participation of Native Speakers

- 42% of the posts come from native English speakers
- 46% of the words come from native French speakers
- Many native speakers post more than once
- What is the motivation?
Analysis

- Affordances
- Disadvantages
- WRF as a rich source for CMC data
Affordances

- Access to multiple speakers across the globe
- Free
- Can learn about different cultures when this sort of topic is discussed
- Engagement of community members
- Guidance of moderators
Access to multiple speakers

- Native (emic perspective)
- Non-native (etic perspective)
- Anyone with Internet access
I know exactly what you feel because I've grown up in a rural part of Beaujolais (I love my "campagne" but really, I'm better off in the city!) and relationships with people around you are quite different in small villages compared to big cities. It's a whole new world for someone who has never really lived in small villages and I guess it must be hard to understand the codes and sense of decorum for someone who comes from the city or from a big town... And still harder for someone who is not French!

But I have some good tips for you 😊
There's no easy answer, but I generally use "tu" if I'd address the person by his or her first name, and "vous" if I'd say Mr. Ms. etc. Of course, it's also a matter of personal taste - some French speakers very rarely use "tu", except with very close friends, and some, particularly in Quebec, use "tu" most of the time. Of course, if it's plural, you'd always use "vous".

Hope I helped,

M.H.

Actually, I say, always err on the side of "vousvoyer" everyone. Use "vous" if you’re not sure.

And I am replying in particular to your post, M. Hoole, because you mentioned how using "tu" is more frequent in Québec but I’m inclined to agree AND disagree. Many of us of even still my generation (I was born in 1973), had to use "vous" with grandparents and older relatives. My parents used "vous" with their parents and so on back. Of course, it will all depend on the family, but this maybe explains why in general I am very formal and polite in my dealings with others I first meet and sometimes shocked when a stranger uses "tu" with me.
Well there are silly rules in every natural language. French is definitely no exception! We sort of have the same thing in English-speaking cultures with first name vs. last name. It's not exactly equal to tutoyement/vouvoiement but it's the same idea. A student in Joe Smith's class would NEVER just say "Joe", for example, but always "Mr. Smith".
This issue is culturally specific to English speakers, since they have, ages back, removed the distinction between vous (polite tone) and tu (informal tone). In most of the other languages, like french, german, spanish, italian, indian, japanese etc, there is a clear distinction between polite & informal forms of address. For example, in the Hindi heartland, you may shower the choicest expletives on a person, (and still get away with it) but if you dare use 'tu', it means war.
Engagement of community members

- Native French speakers are engaged in the community—they care enough to answer questions about their own language
- 46% of the posts in this thread were by native speakers
- Many of the native speakers post more than once
- Moderators are engaged in keeping the threads relevant/appropriate
Guidance of moderators

- Moderators have the ability to edit or delete posts if they feel that the content is not relevant to the thread.
- They can also merge threads if they feel that there are too many separate threads discussing the same topic.
- They can even ban posters who do not engage or align appropriately with the task.
Disadvantages

- Time differences
- No “instructor” guiding the discussion
- Cultural clashes
- Anonymity of posters
Time differences

- Sometimes there are several turns between non-native speakers, perhaps because the native speakers, who have sometimes a ~7 hour time difference, are asleep!

- This can lead to non-natives speculating, using “intuitions” that might not be native-like, and more limited experience/anecdotes

- The more general issue of this being asynchronous communication
Hi all,

I understand when to use tu and when to use vous, but when I'm speaking French and not thinking about it, often "tu" will come out when I mean to say "vous". I'm going to be living in France for nine months and I'm sure that during that time I'll inadvertently call somebody "tu" who I should be calling "vous". So, I want to ask you, how bad is it? Is it a horrendously grave insult to disrespectfully call someone "tu", or is it not so bad? Or maybe somewhere in between? Thanks for your time.

Brennan Vincent

I had the same problem when I started learning French. "Tu" would pop out randomly, and many francophones appeared disturbed by my sudden change. The reason, I guess, was that I referred to both my classmates and teachers with "tu" and knew most expressions/conjugations better with "tu". With time (not a long time, mind you - after I recognized this problem it only took a couple weeks to phase out of it), I managed to observe the tu/vous difference. I thought, afterward, "Shouldn't the francophones realize that I'm a new learner and unaware of the subtleties of the language?", but apparently it was still rather disturbing to them to "les tutoyer" without knowing them very well.

I guess it's just something that comes with time.
Matt_11

Banned

My french teacher told me that as much as the will not be happy with you calling them by the Tu form, they will immediately realize why, you are obviously not a french native and they will know that by your accent, so they should allow it to pass by with out too much conflict, you will want to try not too do it, just to be sure you don't hurt someone's feelings, but with a non-francophone accent im sure they won't be too mad. Its like being a foreigner anywhere else, they know your foreign, and they will understand.

On that topic, what is the reason for it being offensive, it means the same thing, its just one is more formal, for an acquaintance, who came up with such a dumb rule for the language? lol

Reply With Quote

uman

Senior Member

Well there are silly rules in every natural language. French is definitely no exception! We sort of have the same thing in English-speaking cultures with first name vs. last name. It's not exactly equal to tutoyement/vouvoyement but it's the same idea. A student in Joe Smith's class would NEVER just say "Joe", for example, but always "Mr. Smith".
OK, the consensus seems to be that they'll understand I'm a foreigner and so won't take grave offense. I've got another, related question. How much offense would it cause if one native French speaker called another native French speaker "tu" inappropriately?

No, this isn't the consensus 😁. You've heard two opinions regarding the situation - one of which is someone's teacher's opinion, and another of which is an actual anecdote. I'd like to believe that most francophones would hear your accent and immediately realize...
that you didn't mean to say "tu", this isn't the case many times. I'd sometimes see the "cringe" expression on someone's face after being called by "tu", if I did it inappropriately, and would normally apologize, explaining that it was an accident. We in English sometimes do the same thing - for instance, we sometimes are surprised when foreigners use profanity without being familiar with its magnitude.

That said, hopefully after two or three months in France, this tendency to interchange tu and vous will disappear. And in the interim, hopefully you'll encounter speakers who will recognize the accent and be sympathetic, rather than offended, when the problem occurs.

As for your other question, normally a francophone would know what he or she was doing. If a francophone used tu inappropriately, it would often be specifically to convey disrespect, colloquialism or contempt.
Originally Posted by uman

OK, the consensus seems to be that they'll understand I'm a foreigner and so won't take grave offense.

I agree with starcreator, this isn't the consensus. I suggest you take care of the difference between "tu" and "vous" when speaking French in spite of the fact you're a foreigner 😊

Originally Posted by uman

I've got another, related question. How much offense would it cause if one native French speaker called another native French speaker "tu" inappropriately?

It depends, basically it would be considered rather impolite. But if you're being introduced to friends by a friend you can "tutoyer"...please also remember not to shake the hand of a girl when being introduced, just give her a kiss on both cheeks (to shake her hand would look sort of odd), but if you're introduced to a girl/woman for professional reasons you are supposed to shake her hand, of course
No “instructor”

- No one is guiding the discussion
- Sometimes the discussion gets off-topic before a moderator can intervene (again, a disadvantage of the asynchronous nature of the fora)
Hi all,
Need a bit of clarity on the difference between 'vous' and 'tu' (as in where it is used).
As we all know, French (unlike English) has two forms of address, i.e. vous & tu,
similar to Indian languages, where the distinction between the polite and informal form of
address is quite strict.
In fact most of the Indian languages like Hindi, Bengali, Oriya etc. have 3 forms of
address viz. Polite, Informal & Casual, and their usage is strictly defined and adhered to.

I have given below some permutations & combinations of relationships.
Kindly correct if there are any errors.

TU :
Between husband-wife, lovers, friends, casual acquaintances
to anybody younger or lower position.

VOUS :
Stranger / Acquaintance,
to anybody older (unless it's an old servant) or higher position,

Any suggestions? Thanks.

Moderator note: see also tu / vous - married couples, lovers

Last edited by jann; 18th November 2013 at 7:12 PM. Reason: note
TU:
Between husband-wife, lovers, friends, casual acquaintances to anybody younger or lower position.

VOUS:
Stranger / Acquaintance, to anybody older (unless its an old servant) or higher position,

Unfortunately, you can't limit the use of "Tu" or "Vous" to these cases.

Some examples:
- a professor will use "vous" when talking to a student
- a CEO will use "vous" when talking to his employees
- a mother-in-law will use "tu" when talking with her son's/daughter's spouse but this spouse will use "vous" when talking to his/her mother-in-law
- and so on...

Last edited by jann; 18th November 2013 at 7:13 PM. Reason: cited post trimmed to save space
TU:
...

to anybody younger or lower position.

VOUS:
...

to anybody older (unless its an old servant) or higher position,

Perhaps that's a bit dated in European terms. Using "tu" to somebody in a lower position would not be considered polite - it means you want to insist on your superiority. I've never had, nor come across, a servant but I would assume one would have to be very pompous to use "tu".
Perhaps that's a bit dated in European terms. Using "tu" to somebody in a lower position would not be considered polite - it means you want to insist on your superiority. I've never had, nor come across, a servant but I would assume one would have to be very pompous to use "tu".

Je suis tout à fait d'accord avec Uncle Bob, la situation hiérarchique n'a plus réellement d'influence sur l'emploi du 'tu', et il est très impoli d'employer le 'tu' avec un subordonné ou un employé de maison par exemple (à moins que les deux personnes soient amies, ou s'accordent sur ce point, et utilisent toutes deux le 'tu').

Donc, désolée NKOS mais une liste d'emploi du 'tu' et du 'vous' risque de comporter plus de cas spéciaux que de cas généraux ! (Un autre exemple me vient à l'esprit : celui du policier qui utilise le 'tu' pour parler à un suspect et asseoir son autorité).
Thank you all for your valuable inputs.
Perhaps I failed to mentioned that I was talking in an Indian context, where the rules of social etiquettes are a bit different from a modern european context, although not very dissimilar.
And yes Uncle Bob, you will find huge traces of the feudal hangover in the Indian subcontinent (except for the metro cities), where the social distinction between 'master' and 'servant' is enormous.
And what you would label as laughable or pompous, would be viewed quite seriously halfway around the globe.

So just to clear any confusion, I'm just reiterating the above mentioned - that in the french context, it is always safe to use 'vous', whenever in doubt; and that 'tu' is mostly used amongst friends or for the younger generation (where there is familiarity) or children or in certain situations as mentioned above by Chat Perché.
Anonymity of posters

- Who is posting?
  - e.g. Is this really a native speaker responding to the question?
  - Are they providing accurate information, or are they making things up?
What can we learn from WRF?

- What kinds of questions do non-natives ask?
- Who responds to the questions?
- *Tu vs. vous* is a pragmatic variable
  - What do the posts tell us about native and non-native pragmatic competence?
  - Is there an aspect of cultural exchange?
- Is this telecollaborative learning?
- Is there a pedagogical element that we can incorporate in the classroom?
WRF as a rich source for CMC data

- emoticons
- users can embed images, links from Dailymotion; Facebook; Liveleak; Metacafe; Vimeo; YouTube;
- users can link to others’ profiles in their responses
- thanking/acknowledgement strategies
- greetings/addressivity
Conclusion

Unlike *Cultura* (as analyzed by Blyth, 2012), WordReference is not an example of directed telecollaborative learning, as the learners are the first participants to post threads, asking questions about anything ranging from simple grammar questions to the pragmatic nuances of the *tu* vs. *vous* distinction. However, the presence of moderators and engaged native speakers allows for the learner-directed threads to have some guidance from the more competent (Wenger, 2000, 227) members of the group. The fact that this discussion is online and is open internationally to anyone who wishes to post means that people move in and out of the community, and that there are potentially newcomers (Wenger, 2000, 226) every day. The presence of the moderators and engaged senior members helps teach the newcomers how “WordReference is done”, so that when this community of practice functions properly, posters not only learn the answers to their questions, they also learn how to interact in this particular community.


www.wordreference.com